

## Annales Universitatis Paedagogicae Cracoviensis Studia Mathematica XV (2016)

*Iz-iddine EL-Fassi*

### On the superstability of generalized d'Alembert harmonic functions

**Abstract.** The aim of this paper is to study the superstability problem of the d'Alembert type functional equation

$$f(x+y+z) + f(x+y+\sigma(z)) + f(x+\sigma(y)+z) + f(\sigma(x)+y+z) \\ = 4f(x)f(y)f(z)$$

for all  $x, y, z \in G$ , where  $G$  is an abelian group and  $\sigma: G \rightarrow G$  is an endomorphism such that  $\sigma(\sigma(x)) = x$  for an unknown function  $f$  from  $G$  into  $\mathbb{C}$  or into a commutative semisimple Banach algebra.

#### 1. Introduction

In 1940, Ulam [19] gave a wide ranging talk before the Mathematics Club of the University of Wisconsin in which he discussed a number of important unsolved problems and among those the following question concerning the stability of homomorphisms

*Let  $G_1$  be a group and let  $(G_2, d)$  be a metric group. Given  $\delta > 0$ , does there exist  $\epsilon > 0$  such that if a mapping  $h: G_1 \rightarrow G_2$  satisfies the inequality*

$$d(h(xy), h(x)h(y)) \leq \delta$$

*for all  $x, y \in G_1$ , then there is a homomorphism  $a: G_1 \rightarrow G_2$  with*

$$d(h(x), a(x)) \leq \epsilon$$

*for all  $x \in G_1$ ?*

---

AMS (2010) Subject Classification: 39B82, 39B52.

Keywords and phrases: stability, d'Alembert functional equation.

In 1941, Hyers [10] considered the case of approximately additive mappings  $f: E \rightarrow F$ , where  $E$  and  $F$  are Banach spaces and  $f$  satisfies Hyers inequality

$$\|f(x+y) - f(x) - f(y)\| \leq \epsilon$$

for all  $x, y \in E$  and  $\epsilon > 0$ . He proved that then there exists a unique additive mapping  $T: E \rightarrow F$  satisfying

$$\|f(x) - T(x)\| \leq \epsilon$$

for all  $x \in E$ .

The above result was generalized by Bourgin [7] and Aoki [1] in 1949 and 1950. In 1978 and 1982, Hyers' result was improved by Th.M. Rassias [16] and J.M. Rassias [15]. Namely, the condition bounded by the constant was replaced by the condition bounded by two variables. Thereafter it was improved by Găvruta [9] to the condition bounded by the function.

In 1979, Baker et al. [4] and Bourgin [7] introduced that if  $f$  satisfies the inequality  $|E_1(f) - E_2(f)| \leq \epsilon$ , then either  $f$  is bounded or  $E_1(f) = E_2(f)$ . This concept is now known as the superstability. In 1980, the superstability of the cosine functional equation (also called the d'Alembert functional equation)

$$f(x+y) + f(x-y) = 2f(x)f(y) \quad (\text{A})$$

was investigated by Baker [5]; also by Badora [2] in 1998, and Badora and Ger [3] in 2002 under the condition  $|f(x+y) + f(x-y) - 2f(x)f(y)| \leq \epsilon$ ,  $\varphi(x)$  or  $\varphi(y)$ , respectively. Also the stability of the d'Alembert functional equation is founded in papers [6, 11, 13, 18]. In [8] J. Brzdęk et al. gave the recent development of the conditional stability of the homomorphism equation. Recently, G.H. Kim [12] investigated the stability of the generalized d'Alembert type functional equation as follows

$$f(x+y) + f(x+\sigma(y)) = 2f(x)f(y), \quad (\text{A}_f)$$

where  $f$  is an unknown function. In [14] H.M. Kim, G.H. Kim and M.H. Han proved the superstability of approximate d'Alembert harmonic functions

$$f(x+y+z) + f(x+y-z) + f(x-y+z) + f(y+z-x) = 4f(x)f(y)f(z)$$

on an abelian group and on a commutative semisimple Banach algebra.

In this paper, let  $(G, +)$  be an abelian group,  $\mathbb{C}$  the field of complex numbers,  $\mathbb{R}$  denote the set of real numbers, and let  $\sigma$  be an endomorphism of  $G$  with  $\sigma(\sigma(x)) = x$  for all  $x \in G$ .

The aim of this paper is to investigate the superstability problem of the generalized d'Alembert type functional equation as follows

$$\begin{aligned} f(x+y+z) + f(x+y+\sigma(z)) + f(x+\sigma(y)+z) + f(\sigma(x)+y+z) \\ = 4f(x)f(y)f(z) \end{aligned} \quad (1)$$

for all  $x, y, z \in G$ , where  $G$  is an abelian group and  $f: G \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$ . Moreover, we extend all superstability results for equation (1) to the superstability on the commutative semisimple Banach algebra.

In the special case, if  $\sigma(x) = -x$  we obtain the result that is in [14].

## 2. Superstability of equation (1)

In this section, we will investigate the superstability of (1). The functional equation (1) is connected with the d'Alembert functional equation  $(A_f)$  as follows [12].

LEMMA 2.1

Let  $f$  be a complex-valued function on an abelian group  $G$  such that  $f(0) > 0$ . Then,  $f$  satisfies (1) on  $G$  if and only if  $f$  satisfies  $(A_f)$  on  $G$ .

*Proof.* Assume that  $f$  satisfies  $(A_f)$  on  $G$ . Then, we have

$$\begin{aligned} f(x+y+z) + f(x+y+\sigma(z)) + f(x+\sigma(y)+z) + f(\sigma(x)+y+z) \\ &= 2f(x+y)f(z) + f(x+\sigma(y)+z) + f(\sigma(x+\sigma(y))+z) \\ &= 2f(x+y)f(z) + 2f(x+\sigma(y))f(z) \\ &= 2f(z)(f(x+y) + f(x+\sigma(y))) \\ &= 4f(x)f(y)f(z) \end{aligned}$$

for all  $x, y, z \in G$ .

For the converse, we consider  $f$  satisfying (1) on  $G$ . Putting  $x = y = z = 0$  in (1) and as  $f(0) > 0$ , we get  $f(0) = 1$ . Setting  $y = z = 0$  in (1), we obtain

$$f(\sigma(x)) = f(x)$$

for all  $x \in G$ . Next, taking  $z := 0$  in (1), we get

$$\begin{aligned} 2f(x+y) + 2f(x+\sigma(y)) &= f(x+y) + f(x+y) + f(x+\sigma(y)) + f(\sigma(x+\sigma(y))) \\ &= f(x+y) + f(x+y) + f(x+\sigma(y)) + f(\sigma(x)+y) \\ &= 4f(x)f(y)f(0) \end{aligned}$$

for all  $x, y \in G$ . Then,  $f$  satisfies the d'Alembert functional equation  $(A_f)$  on  $G$ . This completes the proof.

THEOREM 2.2

Let  $f: G \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$  be a function and let  $\varphi: G \rightarrow [0, +\infty[$  satisfy the inequality

$$\begin{aligned} |f(x+y+z) + f(x+y+\sigma(z)) + f(x+\sigma(y)+z) \\ + f(\sigma(x)+y+z) - 4f(x)f(y)f(z)| \\ \leq \varphi(x) \end{aligned} \quad (2)$$

for all  $x, y, z \in G$ . Then, either  $f$  is bounded or  $f$  satisfies the functional equation (1).

*Proof.* If  $f$  is unbounded, then we can choose a sequence  $\{y_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  in  $G$  such that

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} |f(y_n)| = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} |f(\sigma(y_n))| = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} |f(\sigma(-y_n))| = \infty$$

and

$$|f(y_n)f(\sigma(-y_n))| > 1.$$

Taking  $y = y_n$  and  $z = \sigma(-y_n)$  in (2), we get

$$|f(x + y_n - \sigma(y_n)) + f(\sigma(x) + y_n - \sigma(y_n)) - f(x)(4f(y_n)f(\sigma(-y_n)) - 2)| \leq \varphi(x)$$

for all  $x \in G$ . Then

$$\begin{aligned} & \left| \frac{f(x + y_n - \sigma(y_n)) + f(\sigma(x) + y_n - \sigma(y_n))}{4f(y_n)f(\sigma(-y_n)) - 2} - f(x) \right| \\ & \leq \frac{\varphi(x)}{|4f(y_n)f(\sigma(-y_n)) - 2|} \end{aligned} \quad (3)$$

for all  $x \in G$ . Passing to the limit as  $n \rightarrow \infty$  in (3), we obtain the following

$$f(x) = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(x + y_n - \sigma(y_n)) + f(\sigma(x) + y_n - \sigma(y_n))}{4f(y_n)f(\sigma(-y_n)) - 2} \quad (4)$$

for all  $x \in G$ . From (4), we will see that

$$f(\sigma(x)) = f(x) \quad (5)$$

for all  $x \in G$ .

Now, we will apply (3) to derive functional equation (1). Putting  $y_n - \sigma(y_n) + y$  in the place of  $y$  in (2), we get

$$\begin{aligned} & |f(x + y_n - \sigma(y_n) + y + z) + f(x + y_n - \sigma(y_n) + y + \sigma(z)) \\ & \quad + f(x + \sigma(y_n - \sigma(y_n)) + y) + z) + f(\sigma(x) + y_n - \sigma(y_n) + y + z) \\ & \quad - 4f(x)f(y_n - \sigma(y_n) + y)f(z)| \\ & \leq \varphi(x) \end{aligned} \quad (6)$$

for all  $x, y, z \in G$ . Putting  $y_n - \sigma(y_n) + \sigma(y)$  in the place of  $y$  in (2), we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} & |f(x + y_n - \sigma(y_n) + \sigma(y) + z) + f(x + y_n - \sigma(y_n) + \sigma(y) + \sigma(z)) \\ & \quad + f(x + \sigma(y_n - \sigma(y_n)) + \sigma(y)) + z) + f(\sigma(x) + y_n - \sigma(y_n) + \sigma(y) + z) \\ & \quad - 4f(x)f(y_n - \sigma(y_n) + \sigma(y))f(z)| \\ & \leq \varphi(x) \end{aligned} \quad (7)$$

for all  $x, y, z \in G$ . Combining (6) and (7) gives

$$\begin{aligned} & |f(x + y_n - \sigma(y_n) + y + z) + f(x + \sigma(y_n - \sigma(y_n)) + \sigma(y)) + z) \\ & \quad + f(x + y_n - \sigma(y_n) + y + \sigma(z)) + f(\sigma(x) + y_n - \sigma(y_n) + \sigma(y) + z) \\ & \quad + f(x + \sigma(y_n - \sigma(y_n)) + y) + z) + f(x + y_n - \sigma(y_n) + \sigma(y) + z) \\ & \quad + f(\sigma(x) + y_n - \sigma(y_n) + y + z) + f(x + y_n - \sigma(y_n) + \sigma(y) + \sigma(z)) \\ & \quad - 4f(x)f(z)(f(y_n - \sigma(y_n) + y) + f(y_n - \sigma(y_n) + \sigma(y)))| \\ & \leq 2\varphi(x) \end{aligned} \quad (8)$$

for all  $x, y, z \in G$ . Using the fact (4) and (5), we see that

$$\begin{aligned} & \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(x + y + z + y_n - \sigma(y_n)) + f(\sigma(x) + y_n - \sigma(y_n) + \sigma(y) + \sigma(z))}{4f(y_n)f(\sigma(-y_n)) - 2} \\ & = f(x + y + z) \end{aligned}$$

for all  $x, y, z \in G$ . Similarly,

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(x + y_n - \sigma(y_n) + y + \sigma(z)) + f(\sigma(x) + y_n - \sigma(y_n) + \sigma(y) + z)}{4f(y_n)f(\sigma(-y_n)) - 2} = f(x + y + \sigma(z)),$$

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(x + \sigma(y_n - \sigma(y_n)) + y) + z + f(x + y_n - \sigma(y_n) + \sigma(y) + z)}{4f(y_n)f(\sigma(-y_n)) - 2} = f(x + \sigma(y) + z)$$

and

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(\sigma(x) + y_n - \sigma(y_n) + y + z) + f(x + y_n - \sigma(y_n) + \sigma(y) + \sigma(z))}{4f(y_n)f(\sigma(-y_n)) - 2} = f(\sigma(x) + y + z)$$

for all  $x, y, z \in G$ . Therefore, dividing inequality (8) by  $|4f(y_n)f(\sigma(-y_n)) - 2|$  and taking the limit as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ , we get

$$\begin{aligned} f(x + y + z) + f(x + y + \sigma(z)) + f(x + \sigma(y) + z) + f(\sigma(x) + y + z) \\ = 4f(x)f(y)f(z) \end{aligned}$$

for all  $x, y, z \in G$ . This completes the proof.

#### COROLLARY 2.3

Let  $f: G \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$  be a function and  $\varphi: G \rightarrow [0, +\infty[$  satisfy the inequality

$$\begin{aligned} |f(x + y + z) + f(x + y + \sigma(z)) + f(x + \sigma(y) + z) \\ + f(\sigma(x) + y + z) - 4f(x)f(y)f(z)| \\ \leq \varphi(y) \text{ or } \varphi(z) \end{aligned}$$

for all  $x, y, z \in G$ . Then, either  $f$  is bounded or  $f$  satisfies the functional equation (1).

*Proof.* Similarly as in the proof of Theorem 2.2, we conclude the desired result.

#### COROLLARY 2.4 ([14, Theorem 2.2])

Let  $f: G \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$  be a function and  $\varphi: G \rightarrow [0, +\infty[$  satisfy the inequality

$$\begin{aligned} |f(x + y + z) + f(x + y - z) + f(x - y + z) \\ + f(y + z - x) - 4f(x)f(y)f(z)| \\ \leq \varphi(x) \text{ or } \varphi(y) \text{ or } \varphi(z) \end{aligned}$$

for all  $x, y, z \in G$ . Then, either  $f$  is bounded or  $f$  satisfies the functional equation  $f(x + y + z) + f(x + y - z) + f(x - y + z) + f(y + z - x) = 4f(x)f(y)f(z)$  on  $G$ .

*Proof.* It suffices to take  $\sigma(x) = -x$  in Theorem 2.2.

#### COROLLARY 2.5

Let  $f: G \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$  be a function and  $\varphi: G \rightarrow [0, +\infty[$  satisfy the inequality

$$|f(x + y + z) - f(x)f(y)f(z)| \leq \varphi(x) \text{ or } \varphi(y) \text{ or } \varphi(z)$$

for all  $x, y, z \in G$ . Then, either  $f$  is bounded or  $f$  satisfies the functional equation  $f(x + y + z) = f(x)f(y)f(z)$  on  $G$ .

*Proof.* It suffices to take  $\sigma(x) = x$  in Theorem 2.2.

### 3. Extension to Banach algebra

In this section, let  $(G, +)$  be an abelian group and  $(E, \|\cdot\|)$  be a commutative semisimple Banach algebra. All the results in Section 2 can be extended to the superstability of (1) on the commutative semisimple Banach algebra.

#### THEOREM 3.1

Let  $f: G \rightarrow E$  be a function and  $\varphi: G \rightarrow [0, +\infty[$  satisfy the inequality

$$\begin{aligned} & \|f(x+y+z) + f(x+y+\sigma(z)) + f(x+\sigma(y)+z) \\ & \quad + f(\sigma(x)+y+z) - 4f(x)f(y)f(z)\| \\ & \leq \varphi(x) \end{aligned} \tag{9}$$

for all  $x, y, z \in G$ . For an arbitrary linear multiplicative functional  $x^* \in E^*$ , if the superposition  $x^* \circ f$  is unbounded, then  $f$  satisfies (1).

*Proof.* Suppose that (9) holds, and fix an arbitrary linear multiplicative functional  $x^* \in E^*$ . Let  $\|x^*\| = 1$  without loss of generality. Then, for every  $x, y, z \in G$ , we get

$$\begin{aligned} \varphi(x) & \geq \|f(x+y+z) + f(x+y+\sigma(z)) + f(x+\sigma(y)+z) \\ & \quad + f(\sigma(x)+y+z) - 4f(x)f(y)f(z)\| \\ & = \sup_{\|z^*\|=1} |z^*(f(x+y+z) + f(x+y+\sigma(z)) + f(x+\sigma(y)+z) \\ & \quad + f(\sigma(x)+y+z) - 4f(x)f(y)f(z))| \\ & \geq |(x^* \circ f)(x+y+z) + (x^* \circ f)(x+y+\sigma(z)) + (x^* \circ f)(x+\sigma(y)+z) \\ & \quad + (x^* \circ f)(\sigma(x)+y+z) - 4(x^* \circ f)(x)(x^* \circ f)(y)(x^* \circ f)(z)| \end{aligned}$$

which states that the superposition  $x^* \circ f: G \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$  yields a solution of the inequality (2), since the superposition  $x^* \circ f$  is unbounded, Theorem 2.2 shows that the superposition  $x^* \circ f$  is a solution of equation (1). In other words, bearing the linear multiplicativity of  $x^*$  in mind, for all  $x, y, z \in G$ , the difference  $D_\sigma f(x, y, z): G \times G \times G \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$  falls into the kernel of  $x^*$ , where  $D_\sigma f(x, y, z) := f(x+y+z) + f(x+y+\sigma(z)) + f(x+\sigma(y)+z) + f(\sigma(x)+y+z) - 4f(x)f(y)f(z)$ . Therefore, in view of the unrestricted choice of  $x^*$ , we infer that

$$D_\sigma f(x, y, z) \in \bigcap \{\text{Ker } x^* : x^* \text{ is a linear multiplicative member of } E^*\}$$

for all  $x, y, z \in G$ . Since the algebra  $E$  has been assumed to be semisimple, the last term of the above formula coincides with the singleton  $\{0\}$ , i.e

$$\forall x, y, z \in G \quad D_\sigma f(x, y, z) = 0$$

as claimed. This completes the proof.

#### REMARK 3.2

By the similar manner, we can prove that if the difference  $D_\sigma f(x, y, z)$  is bounded by  $\varphi(y)$  or  $\varphi(z)$ , we obtain the same result as in Theorem 3.1.

## COROLLARY 3.3

Let  $\varphi: G \rightarrow [0, +\infty[$  be a function and  $f: G \rightarrow E$  satisfy the inequality

$$\|f(x+y+z) + f(x+y-z) + f(x-y+z) + f(y+z-x) - 4f(x)f(y)f(z)\| \leq \varphi(x) \text{ or } \varphi(y) \text{ or } \varphi(z)$$

for all  $x, y, z \in G$ . For an arbitrary linear multiplicative functional  $x^* \in E^*$ , if the superposition  $x^* \circ f$  is unbounded, then  $f$  satisfies

$$f(x+y+z) + f(x+y-z) + f(x-y+z) + f(y+z-x) = 4f(x)f(y)f(z)$$

for all  $x, y, z \in G$ .

## THEOREM 3.4

Let  $\varphi: \mathbb{R} \rightarrow [0, +\infty[$  and  $f: \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$  satisfy the inequality

$$\begin{aligned} &|f(x+y+z) + f(x+y+\sigma(z)) + f(x+\sigma(y)+z) \\ &\quad + f(\sigma(x)+y+z) - 4f(x)f(y)f(z)| \\ &\leq \varphi(x) \end{aligned}$$

for all  $x, y, z \in \mathbb{R}$ . If  $f$  is an unbounded harmonic function, then there is a constant  $\alpha \in \mathbb{C}^* \setminus i\mathbb{R}$  such that  $f(x) = \frac{e^{\alpha x} + e^{\alpha \sigma(x)}}{2}$  and  $f$  is a solution of the equation  $(A_f)$ .

*Proof.* By Theorem 2.2,  $f$  satisfies the functional equation (1). Suppose that  $f$  is unbounded and  $f(0) = 0$ . Putting  $y = z := 0$  in (1), we get

$$3f(x) + f(\sigma(x)) = 4f(x)f(0)^2 = 0 \quad (10)$$

for all  $x \in \mathbb{R}$ . Replacing  $x$  by  $\sigma(x)$  in (10) and then combining the equalities, we see that  $f(\sigma(x)) = -f(x)$  for all  $x \in \mathbb{R}$ , so  $f(x) = 0$  for all  $x \in \mathbb{R}$ . This is a contradiction. Therefore,  $|f(0)| > 0$ . Hence,  $f$  satisfies also the equation  $(A_f)$  by Lemma 2.1. It is well known that a harmonic solution  $f: \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$  of the d'Alembert functional equation  $(A_f)$  has to have the form  $f(x) = \frac{e^{\alpha x} + e^{\alpha \sigma(x)}}{2}$  for all  $x \in \mathbb{R}$ , where  $\alpha$  is a complex number (see [17, Theorem 1]). Since  $f$  is unbounded, the constant  $\alpha$  of that form falls into the set  $\alpha \in \mathbb{C}^* \setminus i\mathbb{R}$ . This completes the proof.

## REMARK 3.5

Similarly, one can prove that if the difference  $D_\sigma f(x, y, z)$  is bounded by  $\varphi(y)$  or  $\varphi(z)$ , we obtain the same result as in Theorem 3.4.

## COROLLARY 3.6

Assume that  $\varphi: \mathbb{R} \rightarrow [0, +\infty[$  and  $f: \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$  satisfy the inequality

$$\begin{aligned} &|f(x+y+z) + f(x+y-z) + f(x-y+z) + f(y+z-x) - 4f(x)f(y)f(z)| \\ &\leq \varphi(x) \text{ or } \varphi(y) \text{ or } \varphi(z) \end{aligned}$$

for all  $x, y, z \in \mathbb{R}$ . If  $f$  is an unbounded harmonic function, then there is a constant  $\beta \in \mathbb{C} \setminus \mathbb{R}$  such that  $f(x) = \cos(\beta x)$  and  $f$  is a solution of the equation (A).

*Proof.* It suffices to take  $\sigma(x) = -x$  and  $\beta = i\alpha$  in Theorem 3.4.

## References

- [1] Aoki, Tosio. "On the stability of the linear transformation in Banach spaces." *J. Math. Soc. Japan* 2 (1950): 64-66. Cited on 6.
- [2] Badora, Roman. "On the stability of the cosine functional equation." *Rocznik Nauk.-Dydakt. Prace Mat.* 15 (1998): 5-14. Cited on 6.
- [3] Badora, Roman, and Roman Ger. "On some trigonometric functional inequalities." In *Functional equations—results and advances*, 3-15. Vol. 3 of Adv. Math. (Dordr.) Dordrecht: Kluwer Acad. Publ., 2002. Cited on 6.
- [4] Baker, John A., John W. Lawrence, and Frank A. Zorzitto. "The stability of the equation  $f(x+y) = f(x)f(y)$ ." *Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.* 74, no. 2 (1979): 242-246. Cited on 6.
- [5] Baker, John A. "The stability of the cosine equation." *Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.* 80, no. 3 (1980): 411-416. Cited on 6.
- [6] Bouikhalene, Belaid, Elhoucien Elqorachi, and John M. Rassias. "The superstability of d'Alembert's functional equation on the Heisenberg group." *Appl. Math. Lett.* 23, no. 1 (2010): 105-109. Cited on 6.
- [7] Bourgin, D. G. "Approximately isometric and multiplicative transformations on continuous function rings." *Duke Math. J.* 16 (1949): 385-397. Cited on 6.
- [8] Brzdęk, Janusz, Włodzimierz Fechner, Mohammad Sal Moslehian, and Justyna Sikorska. "Recent developments of the conditional stability of the homomorphism equation." *Banach J. Math. Anal.* 9, no. 3, (2015): 278-326. Cited on 6.
- [9] Găvruta, Paşcu. "A generalization of the Hyers-Ulam-Rassias stability of approximately additive mappings." *J. Math. Anal. Appl.* 184, no. 3, (1994): 431-436. Cited on 6.
- [10] Hyers, Donald H. "On the stability of the linear functional equation." *Proc. Nat. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* 27 (1941): 222-224. Cited on 6.
- [11] Kim, Gwang Hui, and Sang Han Lee. "Stability of the d'Alembert type functional equations." *Nonlinear Funct. Anal. Appl.* 9, no. 4 (2004): 593-604. Cited on 6.
- [12] Kim, Gwang Hui. "The stability of d'Alembert and Jensen type functional equations." *J. Math. Anal. Appl.* 325, no. 1 (2007): 237-248. Cited on 6 and 7.
- [13] Kim, Gwang Hui. "The stability of pexiderized cosine functional equations." *Korean J. Math.* 16, no. 1 (2008): 103-114. Cited on 6.
- [14] Kim, Hark-Mahn, Gwang Hui Kim and Mi Hyun Han. "Superstability of approximate d'Alembert harmonic functions." *J. Ineq. Appl.* 2011, no. 1 (2011): 118. Cited on 6 and 9.
- [15] Rassias, John M. "On approximation of approximately linear mappings by linear mappings." *J. Funct. Anal.* 46, no. 1 (1982): 126-130. Cited on 6.
- [16] Rassias, Themistocles M. "On the stability of the linear mapping in Banach spaces." *Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.* 72, no. 2 (1978): 297-300. Cited on 6.
- [17] Sinopoulos, Pavlos. "Functional equations on semigroups." *Aequationes Math.* 59, no. 3 (2000): 255-261. Cited on 11.
- [18] Székelyhidi, László. "The stability of d'Alembert-type functional equations." *Acta Sci. Math. (Szeged)* 44, no. 3-4 (1982): 313-320. Cited on 6.



- [19] Ulam, Stanisław M. "A collection of mathematical problems." Vol 8 of *Interscience Tracts in Pure and Applied Mathematics*. New York-London: Interscience Publishers, 1960. Cited on 5.

*Department of Mathematics  
Faculty of Sciences  
University of Ibn Tofail  
Kenitra  
Morocco  
E-mail: izidd-math@hotmail.fr*

*Received: October 21, 2015; final version: December 8, 2015;  
available online: January 17, 2016.*